Reviewer's report

Title: A Web-based archive of systematic review data

Version: 1 Date: 28 November 2011

Reviewer: M. Hassan Murad

Reviewer's report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The manuscript is very vague and is not helpful to readers. After reading the manuscript, all I got out of it is that authors are working on some database for systematic reviews that they hope will be ready late 2012. I am unclear at all on how this will be done.

2. How were the “experts” selected and based on which criteria?

3. The timeline seems very unrealistic; authors need to break the steps and timeline further? When did the experts meet? What happened since June 2011? Does the progress since June 2011 implies that the timeline of 2012 feasible?

4. There must be some screen shots for demonstration purposes; otherwise, this is too abstract.

5. There has to be two interfaces for such a database, one for clinicians/policymakers (with quick PICO search demonstrating aggregate effect size and brief description) and one, more complicated interface, for researchers interested in updating systematic reviews (with study-level data and more details).

6. The access to enter data is unclear. If I, as a systematic reviewer, will register my own review, then the access should be very simple (like clinicaltrials.gov) and not burdensome. However, if study-level data need to be entered (verified, or corrected), then more sophisticated users (who need training, resources, stipend) are needed. This is again, very vaguely described.

7. Costs of creating and maintaining the database (the latter being harder) are not described and are clearly needed (otherwise, major feasibility roadblock).

8. Others have been working on this (3 ie project, DARE, Cochrane, Gabriel Rada in Chile, etc.). Will the current work be done in silo and independently from these folks?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.